

Board Members:

Leland Walmsley – Chair
Julie Broughton – Vice-Chair
Carol Terry
Kathy Henry
Lindsey Foucht



Location:

Council Chamber
5775 Carpinteria Avenue
Carpinteria, CA 93013
Time: 5:30 P.M.

**CITY OF CARPINTERIA
TREE ADVISORY BOARD
Thursday, November 3, 2016**

A. CALL TO ORDER

B. ROLL CALL

C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES AND AGENDA

D. PUBLIC COMMENT

This is a time for public comments on matters not otherwise on the agenda, but within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Tree Advisory Board.

E. NEW BUSINESS

Tree Tour – Discuss the various sites visited on the October 22, 2016 Tree Tour as listed below:

- 780 Oak Avenue (x 5401 8th Street) – American Sweet Gum
- 690 Maple Avenue – Queen Palm
- 4696 7th Street – Italian Stone Pine
- 850 Linden Avenue – Tipuana
- 892 Linden Avenue (x Wullbrandt Way) – Tipuana
- Parking Lot #2 – Tipuana (13)
- 4916 Carpinteria Avenue – Windmill Palm
- 1385 Linden Avenue – Fern Pine
- 1360 Limu Drive – Carob
- 1422 Limu Drive – Carob
- 1415 Azalea Drive (x 4690 Aragon Drive) – Carolina Laurel Cherry
- 4596 El Carro Lane (x Eucalyptus Street) – Southern Magnolia (2)
- 1476 Andrea Street – Glossy Privet
- 1347 Camino Trillado – London Plane
- 5481 Granada Way - Carrotwood
- 5384 Ogan Road – Carrotwood
- 5522 Cameo Road – Weeping Bottlebrush

F. MATTERS PRESENTED BY STAFF

G. ADJOURNMENT

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, if you need assistance to participate in this meeting, please contact Melissa Angeles at (805) 755-4445 or the California Relay Service at (866) 735-2929. Notification of two business days prior to the meeting will enable the City to make reasonable arrangements for accessibility to this meeting.

CITY OF CARPINTERIA
5775 Carpinteria Avenue, Carpinteria, CA 93013

MEETING MINUTES OF THE TREE ADVISORY BOARD
THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 18, 2016

A. Call to Order

Chair Walmsley called the meeting to order at 5:30 P.M.

B. Roll Call

Board members present: Chair Leland Walmsley
Vice Chair Julie Broughton
Board member Kathy Henry
Board member Lindsey Foucht

Board members absent: Board member Carol Terry

Staff members present: Paul Medel, Public Works Supervisor
Melissa Angeles, Engineering Technician
Matt Roberts, Parks and Recreation Director

Others present: Bill Spiewak, Consulting Arborist

C. Approval of Minutes and Agenda

Motion by Board member Henry, seconded by Board member Foucht to approve the agenda of February 18, 2016 and the minutes of November 5, 2015. *Motion approved 4-0.*

D. Public Comment

No public comment to report.

E. Old Business

No old business to report.

F. New Business

1. Stone Pine Assessment & Management Plan Discussion

Consulting arborist, Bill Spiewak gave background information on the Italian Stone Pines in the City and the findings from his assessment. He stated that the majority of the trees are relatively healthy but could benefit from a heavy pruning to help mitigate risk. Mr. Spiewak commented about the infrastructure damage being caused by the trees. He compared the Carpinteria trees to those on Anapamu Street in Santa Barbara and said that the trees in both cities are relatively healthy but the infrastructure in Santa Barbara is in really bad shape. He recommended that two trees located at 4823 7th Street and 4791 7th Street be removed due to severe structural damage. He added that he also recommended the removal of a third tree at 4857 7th Street, but the City has since removed it due to a large stress fracture that created a significant risk of tree failure. He recommended that the City address the high risk trees first and then address the lower risk trees.

Meeting Minutes of the Tree Advisory Board
Thursday, February 18, 2016

Jack Bowie, resident at 4850 7th Street, stated that the tree adjacent to his driveway, located at 4848 7th Street, continues to damage his driveway and sidewalk and he is in favor of having the tree removed.

Valerie Bentz, resident at 5367 Ogan Road, said that she would like to see as many Stone Pines retained as possible.

Mike Dale, resident at 4696 7th Street, said that he would like to see the Stone Pine in front of his house removed. He stated that it has caused severe damage to his property.

Marla Daily, resident and business owner at 5045 Wullbrandt Way, said that she would like to see the tree in Parking Lot #2 retained. She would like to see the trees better maintained.

Willie & Millie Navarez, residents at 4823 7th Street, stated that they would like the tree in front of their home removed due to the extensive damage that it has caused to their property. They stated that they are on a fixed income and have already invested thousands of dollars to repair damage caused by the tree.

Chair Walmsley stated that many of the trees are healthy but unfortunately some have been butchered by Edison and have severe structural damage. He added that the City and the Tree Advisory Board want to save all of the trees but have to take risk assessment into consideration.

Vice Chair Broughton said that the budget has to be taken into consideration. She recommended that the high risk trees be pruned first to reduce end weight and then reassess the health of the trees to be sure that they will not split. She also recommended that the trees with immediate damage to personal and public property be addressed first.

Board member Foucht said that the limb sizes should be reduced on a number of trees to reduce risk.

The Board agreed that the tree at 4823 7th Street should be removed and replaced due to its structural damage and the damage it has caused to both private and public property.

A motion was made by Board member Foucht and seconded by Vice Chair Broughton to remove and replace the Italian Stone Pine tree at 4823 7th Street with an approved species from the STMP. Motion approved 4-0.

The Board agreed that the tree at 4791 7th Street should be removed due to its severe structural damage.

A motion was made by Chair Broughton and seconded by Board member Henry to remove and replace the Italian Stone Pine tree at 4791 7th Street with an approved species from the STMP. Motion approved 4-0.

2. Heath Ranch Park Tree Matters

Parks and Recreation Director, Matt Roberts, gave a presentation on the history of the Heath Ranch Park Eucalyptus trees. He spoke about the health of the trees and asked the Board to give the City feedback on how to address them. Mr. Roberts said that the City retained two arborists to conduct assessments of the trees and they recommended that all of the trees except for tree #7 be removed. The age of the trees and risk assessment were taken into consideration when they made their recommendations. The City has taken this matter to the

Meeting Minutes of the Tree Advisory Board
Thursday, February 18, 2016

County Historic Landmarks Advisory Commission who made a recommendation to remove the trees on a health and safety basis through a phased approach. He added that the City had tree #7 assessed more thoroughly and contracted with an arborist to conduct a root zone analysis. The arborist determined that the tree is relatively healthy and recommended a 15 percent foliage reduction to help reduce its end weight. The City has since had the tree pruned.

David Griggs, Director and Curator of the Carpinteria Valley Historical Museum, spoke against the removal of the Eucalyptus trees. He said that some of the threat can be mitigated by proper pruning and added that regular pruning has not been done to the trees since 2005. He added that the trees are a protected historical landmark that needs to be preserved.

Resident Scott Lancet spoke against the removal of the Eucalyptus trees. He would like the City to take a closer look at trees 2, 3, 4, and 5 to figure out what can be done to care for the trees as long as possible. He asked the City to consider relocating the playground to minimize the risk of sudden limb drop on children and park-goers. He added that the raptor habitat should be taken into consideration.

Resident John Steinman said that he is happy to hear that tree 7 has good roots and is unlikely to topple towards his house. He would like the City to consider monitoring the brown rot continually.

Resident Kathleen Reddington spoke against the removal of the trees. She wants the City to prune and continue to maintain the trees and do further assessments on trees 2, 3, 4, and 5.

Resident Marla Daily spoke against the removal of the trees. She said that the trees provide homes for raptors and monarch butterflies and should be saved.

Board member Henry exited the room at 7:20 p.m.

Board member Foucht said he likes the idea of limiting access to the trees. He said that canopy reductions can be considered but having not looked at the trees personally, he is not sure if that is a feasible option.

Parks and Recreation Director, Matt Roberts, said that it will be difficult to create an exclusion zone due to the height of the trees. The targets listed in the arborist reports are homes and private property.

Chair Walmsley said that Sycamore trees are a great replacement tree because they provide a habitat for raptors and can quickly grow to be the size of the Eucalyptus trees if they are watered more frequently. He added that in 2005 a resistograph test was done to each tree and he believes that the trees have not improved since then.

Vice-Chair Broughton said that CEQA guidelines should be considered when making a decision about the trees. She stated that City Municipal Code should also be reviewed to check if it has guidelines on historical trees.

The Board said that they would like to see more public involvement and notification. They requested more time to look through the arborist reports and would like to see the resistograph test from 2005.

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Broughton and seconded by Board member Foucht to table this item to allow the Board more time to review the arborist reports and conduct visual evaluations of each tree. Motion approved 3-0.

Meeting Minutes of the Tree Advisory Board
Thursday, February 18, 2016

G. Matters Presented By Staff

No matters presented by staff.

H. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 7:52 P.M.

The next regular Tree Advisory Board meeting will be on Thursday, May 19, 2016.

CITY OF CARPINTERIA
5775 Carpinteria Avenue, Carpinteria, CA 93013

MEETING MINUTES OF THE TREE ADVISORY BOARD
THURSDAY, APRIL 7, 2016

A. Call to Order

Chair Walmsley called the meeting to order at 5:40 P.M.

B. Roll Call

Board members present: Chair Leland Walmsley
Vice Chair Julie Broughton
Board member Kathy Henry
Board member Lindsey Foucht
Board member Carol Terry

Board members absent: None

Staff members present: Paul Medel, Public Works Supervisor
Melissa Angeles, Engineering Technician
Matt Roberts, Parks and Recreation Director

Others present: Kenneth Knight, Consulting Arborist

C. Public Comment

D. Old Business

1. Heath Ranch Park Eucalyptus Trees

Parks and Recreation Director, Matt Roberts gave a history of the Eucalyptus trees and an update on recent maintenance activities. He stated that the trees are inspected every three to four years but most recently, in 2015, the City contracted two arborists to conduct assessments of the trees. The arborist reports stated that all the trees, except tree #7, pose a significant hazard and action should be taken to prevent injury, property damage or death. The age of the trees and risk assessment were taken into consideration when they made their recommendations. Mr. Roberts added that in 2002, one tree fell over without warning and in 2003 another was removed because it was starting to lean to the north and had noticeable structural defects in its trunk system. Later, in 2005, two other trees were removed at the direction of the City Council because of their high risk rating. After their removal, a landscape architect was retained by the City to develop a succession plan to be implemented as the trees are phased out over the years. The ultimate goal of the plan is to mimic the historic Heath Ranch carriageway. The City has already planted Sycamore trees that follow the succession plan.

Consulting arborist, Kenneth Knight presented the findings from his assessment of the Eucalyptus trees at Heath Ranch Park. He explained that the risk assessment that he conducted assessed the risk to life and property. He said that there is a way of mitigating some of the risk by dramatically reducing the crown of the tree by removing the majority of the limbs but the cost is very high. Another option is cabling but it is very costly and in his opinion, it may not be worth investing large amounts of money, when the trees will continue to pose a risk. He

Meeting Minutes of the Tree Advisory Board
Thursday, April 7, 2016

stated that some of the trees were between 90 to 120 feet high and if they were to fall, they would likely go into the property and homes on the opposite side of Eucalyptus Street. In addition, some of the limbs are 12-14 inches in circumference and if they were to break off, they could cause serious damage. A root analysis was conducted on tree #7 and it was determined that the tree is relatively healthy and could be saved but could benefit from a crown reduction. He added that many of the structural problems were due to poor pruning when the trees were young, which led to their current condition.

Mr. Roberts said that tree #7 has already received a 15-percent crown reduction and will continue to be maintained. In addition, mulch and compost have been spread around the base of the tree.

Chair Walmsley asked if there was any way to determine or assess if any of the trees would be likely to topple. Mr. Knight stated that tree #7 was assessed for that risk and did not show any signs of decay or soft wood. He added that the other trees were not assessed and the likelihood of failure increases during extreme weather events.

Chair Walmsley inquired about the cost to trim and cable the trees. He mentioned that the City has limited funds and has to take the maintenance of other trees around the City into consideration as well. Mr. Knight said that he was not positive but estimated that it would cost tens of thousands of dollars to maintain just one tree due to the amount of attention each tree is in need of.

Chair Walmsley asked Mr. Knight how often the trees should be assessed. Mr. Knight said that an annual review would be sufficient.

Board opened public comment period.

Resident Carol Ledig said that she and her husband were both upset when two trees were cut down in 2005. She said that she is against the removal of the remaining trees.

Resident John Culbertson asked the Board to consider safety pruning and a phased removal if necessary. He encouraged the City to continue its tree replacement program.

Resident Scott Lancet asked the Board to consider the possibility of installing attractive fencing to keep people out from under the trees. He feels that not enough information on the root analysis of trees 2, 3, 4 and 5 has been provided. He would like to see warning signs installed along the curbs with information about the tree risk. He also feels that the playground is at risk and should be relocated to another section of the park.

Resident Brian McKee said that he would like the trees to be saved. He feels that the trees are healthy and can be saved if they are pruned and continued to be maintained. He added that the playground should be relocated.

Resident John Stineman said that he lives in the house next to tree #7 and is ecstatic to hear that the tree does not pose a risk to his house at this time but would like the City to continue to maintain and monitor it. He said that he is concerned with tree #5 and feels that it is very high risk and something needs to be done to address it.

Resident Kathleen Reddington said that the City should have the revenue to pay to keep the trees due to recent commercial building sales. She said that the City has the duty to preserve the trees and would like to see more conclusive studies conducted before making a decision.

Meeting Minutes of the Tree Advisory Board
Thursday, April 7, 2016

Carpinteria Valley Historical Museum Curator, David Griggs, said that he would like to see the historical trees preserved. He questioned why one tree is low risk and the rest are moderate to high risk when a thorough root assessment was only done to the low risk tree and not the others. He said that all trees pose a risk and these trees do not seem prone to toppling because they are 140 years old and have not toppled yet and even as their numbers have been reduced and gone through strong wind storms, they have stood firm while trees in other areas have failed. He stated that other cities are willing to accept the risk to keep Tasmanian Blue Gum Eucalyptus trees and has not heard of any incidents of injury there. He asked that the trees be pruned and maintained and a fence be erected to keep the public out. He feels that a fence would not be a big loss to the public because the public tends to congregate in other areas of the park and not directly under the trees. He added that the City should follow the Secretary of the Interior's guidelines for preserving historical trees.

Resident Dorothy Thielges said that she is in favor of keeping the trees and feels that more can be done to maintain them. She suggested that the playground be relocated and a fence be installed to keep people out from under the trees.

Public comment period closed.

Mr. Roberts said that even if the trees were to be pruned, they would have to be topped and would not look anything like they look now due to the maintenance that they need to reduce the risk of sudden limb drop. He said that weaker limbs would sprout from the top of the trees that would create weak joints and require further maintenance and use of City funds. He added that the City has a very low tolerance for risk.

Board member Henry asked what the normal lifespan of the Eucalyptus trees is. Mr. Knight said that their lifespan is about 150 years.

Vice-Chair Broughton said that the Eucalyptus trees do not respond well to cabling and tree topping is unacceptable. She questioned whether the City would still be liable if someone jumps the fence and becomes injured. She asked the public to consider whether they wanted to preserve old trees that pose a high risk or plant new trees that will grow into beautiful trees for future generations.

Board member Foucht said he observed that the park and street are relatively low use. He said that tree #5 is the most concerning but its risk could possibly be mitigated temporarily with fencing, painting a red curb on one side of Eucalyptus Street or limiting parking.

Board member Terry said she would like to see the playground moved away from the trees. She said that tree #5 is unhealthy and unbalanced and she would not be upset if it were removed.

Board member Henry said that the City does not have enough money to maintain the trees but does like the idea of removing tree #5 and fencing the others. She said that her main concern is about people being hurt and the City being liable.

Chair Walmsley reopened the public comment period for one additional speaker.

Resident Antonio Olvera asked the Board to consider removing the playground and installing a fence to keep the public out from under the trees. He said that he would hate to see the trees removed.

Public comment period closed.

Meeting Minutes of the Tree Advisory Board
Thursday, April 7, 2016

The Board agreed that the City should look into ways to reduce risk in the interim before the start of the rain season in November.

A motion was made by Vice-Chair Broughton and seconded by Board member Henry to recommend to the City Council that a contract be established with a certified arborist to develop a five year maintenance and removal and replacement plan for trees 2, 3, 4 and 5 that incorporates International Society of Arboriculture (ISA) standards and is completed prior to the November rainy season. Motion approved 5-0.

E. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 8:00 P.M.

The next regular Tree Advisory Board meeting will be on Thursday, May 19, 2016.

TREE ADVISORY BOARD

MEETING DATE: November 3, 2016

ITEM FOR CONSIDERATION

Discuss the findings from the Annual Tree Tour

Action Item: X **Non-Action Item:** _____

Report prepared by: Melissa Angeles
Department of Public Works

 Melissa Angeles
Signature

Reviewed by: Charles W. Ebeling, P.E.
Director of Public Works/City Engineer

 Charles W. Ebeling, P.E.
Signature

I. RECOMMENDATION

That the City of Carpinteria Tree Advisory Board discuss its findings from the Annual Tree Tour and make a recommendation for each tree requested to be replaced to the City Council for their review.

II. DISCUSSION

The City has a Tree Management Program relating to the planting, care, maintenance, removal, and replacement of trees, shrubs and any other plantings in public areas governed by Carpinteria Municipal Code (Chapter 12.28 CMC). Property owners desiring that a tree be removed or replaced within the public right-of-way fronting their property may submit a letter of request to the City seeking action. Public requests and City staff recommendations are received throughout the year.

Each October, to assist in its making recommendations, the Tree Advisory Board compiles a list of requests for tree replacements and schedules a site visit to see each tree i.e., the "Tree Tour". Trees identified in this process are marked and notice is posted in the newspaper indicating the dates of the site visit and subsequent public meetings. The Tree Advisory Board recommendations are then forwarded to the City Council for review. Property owners requesting tree removals have been encouraged to attend the Board meeting and the subsequent City Council meeting.

This year's Tree Tour was held on Saturday, October 22, 2016.

Attachment A – Tree replacement request list

Attachment A

Tree Replacement Request List

Tree Replacement Requests

- 780 Oak Avenue (x 5401 8th Street) – American Sweet Gum
- 690 Maple Avenue – Queen Palm
- 4696 7th Street – Italian Stone Pine
- 850 Linden Avenue – Tipuana
- 892 Linden Avenue (x Wullbrandt Way) – Tipuana
- Parking Lot #2 – Tipuana (13)
- 4916 Carpinteria Avenue – Windmill Palm
- 1385 Linden Avenue – Fern Pine
- 1360 Limu Drive – Carob
- 1422 Limu Drive – Carob
- 1415 Azalea Drive (x 4690 Aragon Drive) – Carolina Laurel Cherry
- 4596 El Carro Lane (x Eucalyptus Street) – Southern Magnolia (2)
- 1476 Andrea Street – Glossy Privet
- 1347 Camino Trillado – London Plane
- 5481 Granada Way - Carrotwood
- 5384 Ogan Road – Carrotwood
- 5522 Cameo Road – Weeping Bottlebrush